Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.

Comparison of Workers' Compensation Rates Effective December 1, 2015

Six Selected Northeastern States



Delaware Virginia Maryland New Jersey Pennsylvania West Virginia

June 30, 2016

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.

Comparison of Rates: Delaware to Other Northeast States Delaware December 1, 2015 Rating Values

Discussion of workers compensation systems often includes claims or assertions regarding the relative premium costs for this line of insurance in various state jurisdictions. The Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. ("DCRB") is mindful that true premium costs for workers compensation insurance in different states are the result of many variables not generally susceptible to simple or generalized analysis. Especially important variables of this type include differences in classification plans approved in different states and competitive pricing differentials applied by insurance carriers in each jurisdiction. As a means of informing various parties interested in, subject to and/or participating in the Delaware workers compensation system regarding comparative system costs, the DCRB has previously produced studies which compared approved rates in several selected northeastern states to those of Delaware. The most recent such study was dated May 26, 2015 and reflected rating values effective December 1, 2014 using an approach which recognized both of these notable variables.

The DCRB has updated its prior study to recognize the revised residual market rates and voluntary market loss costs that were adopted in Delaware effective December 1, 2015. The results of that update are presented and discussed in this report.

Workers compensation insurance prices are commonly established within the context of statutory and administrative systems, which provide substantial flexibility and diversity to participants in the marketplace. In Delaware, one aspect of this flexibility is that significant numbers of insurers have historically elected not to adopt, or have adopted on a deferred basis, revised DCRB loss costs once approved by the Department of Insurance. Thus, the reader should be aware that some carriers, and potentially many carriers, may either not have completed their individual evaluation of those recently revised rating values and market conditions in order to adjust their own prices if, and to the extent, they may ultimately find them appropriate, or may have elected not to adopt the most recent DCRB loss costs.

In order to prepare this report, the DCRB has used the prevailing loss cost multipliers for each Delaware insurer as of March 1, 2016 together with the approved voluntary market loss costs effective that same date. Further, the DCRB has verified that the carrier(s) thus establishing the "low" and "high" Delaware rates used in this study had adopted DCRB loss costs at least for their January 1, 2016 pricing. In some cases, however, carriers had <u>not</u>, in fact, adopted the approved DCRB December 1, 2015 loss costs as of the date of this report. Individual carriers currently so positioned may or may not adopt the most recently approved DCRB loss costs. Further, such carriers may revise their loss cost multipliers to some extent if, and when, they do elect to make such an adoption. As a consequence, the DCRB views the indications of this specific analysis as subject to ongoing change as market conditions and competitive circumstances evolve.

OVERVIEW OF STUDY RESULTS

• Delaware lowest approved rates for the classifications studied tended to be lower than the lowest rates for New Jersey (except for manufacturing classes). Delaware lowest rates

tended to be higher than the lowest rates in Maryland, Pennsylvania, Virginia and West Virginia. Delaware highest rates were lower than that of Maryland (except for "other" classifications). Delaware highest rates were higher than that of New Jersey (except for manufacturing classes), Pennsylvania, West Virginia and Virginia.

• In addition to the rating values shown in Exhibits 1 and 3, the final costs to policyholders may be significantly influenced by various assessments and/or surcharges that are applicable to premiums rather than rates. The following list shows additional costs that apply to premiums rather than rates for the states included in this study.

Delaware – None

Pennsylvania – Employer assessment factor 1.70%

Maryland – Premium Tax 2.0%, Subsequent Injury Fund 6.5%, Uninsured Employers Fund 2.0% and Workers Compensation Commission Tax 0.02%

New Jersey – Plan Premium Adjustment Program (assigned risk) minimum surcharge 20%, Second Injury Fund 5.81% and Uninsured Employers Fund 0.00%

West Virginia – Regulatory Surcharge 5.0%, Premium Tax 4.0% (waived while Deficit Reduction Surcharge is being charged) and Deficit Reduction Surcharge 9.0%

Virginia – None

- This study was limited by design to a comparison of approved carrier rates in the selected jurisdictions. Such rates exclude potential effects of a broad variety of special rating programs which may be available in some jurisdictions. Thus, this study is directed at the benchmark tabular rates used by insurers as a starting point in determining final premiums but has not analyzed the complex series of possible additional steps which may actually apply in determining each insured's policy premium. As examples of such additional factors, Delaware employers may qualify for some or all of the following special pricing programs:
 - Workplace Safety Program credits premised upon physical inspection of workplace conditions and safety measures in effect in the employer's business.
 - Construction Classification Premium Adjustment Program credits, which recognize effects of significant differences in wage levels between employers on workers compensation insurance premiums.
 - Schedule Rating credits or debits applied based on an individual insurer's assessment of features of an employer's business, which may differ from the usual circumstances expected in a given business enterprise.

- Retrospective rating plans, which effectively rely on the insured's own loss experience in determining final insurance prices.
- Deductible coverage, which allows employers to reduce their workers compensation insurance premiums in return for accepting responsibility for initial payments on claims which may occur for their employees.
- Each jurisdiction studied showed substantial ranges of approved rates within many given Delaware classifications. These ranges of approved rates are attributable, in part, to differences in carrier pricing initiatives and values, such as deviations or loss cost multipliers, and/or to differences in the structure of approved classifications, which cause parts of multiple <u>different</u> classifications in some states to be equivalent to parts of a single <u>common</u> classification in Delaware. Competitive differences in carrier pricing programs are applicable in deriving comparisons of Delaware rates to those of Maryland, Pennsylvania and Virginia and, in fact, produce very significant ranges of carrier rates even within Delaware itself for any given classification. Differences in classification plans apply in the comparisons with all states except Pennsylvania, which uses a classification system identical to that of Delaware for the classifications included in this study.
- While rate comparisons often include statements to the effect that "state X rates are "blank" percent higher (or lower) than those of state Y", this study did not produce single factors for comparison of rates between states. Actually deriving such point estimates would require a significant amount of detail not generally available for analysis. To accurately establish rate differences in this fashion would require separate exposure data, within a state, consistent with the approved classification plan(s) of any <u>other</u> state(s) being included for comparison, and separately reported for each carrier using different rate levels (i.e., rate deviations or loss cost multipliers). Without such information, the proper weights cannot be determined for purposes of computing average rates in each state, and without benefit of these appropriate weights, averages or other similar statistics taken from different states must be viewed with caution.

STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY

For purposes of this study, approved rates and related values were determined as nearly as possible for the effective date of December 1, 2015. In general, the comparable loss costs, rates and/or other rating values pertinent in the other states included in this study initially became effective some time subsequent to December 1, 2015 but remained in effect as of the date of this comparison. Readers of this report should be aware that subsequent revisions in loss costs, rates or rating values will periodically occur in the various states included in this study subsequent to December 1, 2015.

Because the DCRB wanted to be able to comprehensively and correctly identify and account for differences in classification plans in this study, our analysis was limited to certain selected Delaware classifications. In determining which classifications to include in its annual report, the DCRB selected ten (10) classifications from each of the three traditional "Industry Groups"

commonly used in workers compensation pricing analysis: Manufacturing, Contracting and Other Industries. The classifications so selected were the largest Delaware classifications in each Industry Group as measured by "expected losses", a statistic derived by multiplying recent exposures (generally payrolls) times the currently-approved DCRB loss cost values by classification. Based on the most recent available data, the thirty (30) classifications included in this analysis account for over 44 percent of total Delaware expected losses and over 57 percent of total Delaware payrolls.

In order to compare Delaware rates to any other jurisdiction(s), a cross-reference between the classification plans used in Delaware and the comparison state(s) was needed. Development of such a cross-reference involved a thorough review of classification manuals provided by each other jurisdiction included in this comparison, and required a significant effort by an expert member of the DCRB staff. Cross-references were developed for the following states: Maryland, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Virginia and West Virginia, states located in close geographic proximity to Delaware. As was the case in preparing previous studies, a draft of this study has been provided to each contributing jurisdiction for review and comment as a means of verifying the accuracy of information included herein.

Exhibit 1 presents the ranges of approved rates by state in any classification(s) part or all of which correspond to the indicated Delaware classifications studied. Where a state has more than one classification applicable to part(s) of a given Delaware classification, all such classifications are listed in numerical order on successive lines of the exhibit within the Delaware code of interest.

While some comparisons can be made on a "one-for-one" basis, it can be readily seen that review of many classifications requires recognition of multiple classifications in other jurisdictions. In an extreme case, another state, New Jersey, has eight (8) classifications as compared to Delaware classification code 454, with some component(s) in common with a single Delaware classification.

In reviewing Exhibit 1, care must be taken to recognize the purpose and inherent limitations on the information as presented. Classifications shown for each state have been grouped within the pertinent Delaware classifications. The classifications shown for states other than Delaware have NOT necessarily been aligned to allow line-by-line comparisons of classifications and rates between those other states independent of Delaware. For example, while code 4717 is applicable to part of the Delaware code 104 in Maryland and code 2150 is applicable to part of Delaware code 104 in New Jersey, code 4717 in Maryland is not identical to code 2150 in New Jersey.

Exhibit 2 provides general definitions of each code number presented on Exhibit 1 by state, for purposes of clarification and understanding of the various elements of this study.

Delaware, Maryland, Pennsylvania, Virginia and West Virginia all have workers compensation pricing laws which require insurance carriers to establish independent loss cost multipliers or other similar parameters in order to derive their own approved rate schedules. Thus, for each of these states, a "low" and a "high" rate were derived in each classification. These rates reflect the extreme range of approved carrier rating values in each state as provided to the DCRB.

While the DCRB cannot determine the extent to which carriers with these extreme values have written business in each of the classifications studied, the ranges shown do reflect the potential variation of prices in each jurisdiction owing to competitive factors. The bases for the ranges, as shown, are set forth briefly below:

<u>Delaware</u> :	Loss Cost Multipliers (effective as of March 1, 2016) Approved Range from 0.9390 to 2.5810 Approved Loss Costs Effective December 1, 2015
<u>Maryland</u> :	Loss Cost Multipliers (effective as of March 1, 2016) Approved Range from 0.9490 to 3.1850 Approved Loss Costs Effective January 1, 2016 Note : For Maryland, the rating values for the Injured Workers Insurance Fund (IWIF) were not available for this study.
<u>Pennsylvania</u> :	Loss Cost Multipliers (effective as of March 1, 2016) Approved Range from 0.9000 to 3.0280 Approved Loss Costs Effective April 1, 2016
<u>Virginia</u> :	Loss Cost Multipliers (effective as of March 1, 2016) Approved Range from 0.9990 to 2.3990 Approved Loss Costs Effective April 1, 2016
<u>West Virginia</u> :	Loss Cost Multipliers (effective as of March 1, 2016) Approved Range from 0.7500 to 2.4000 Approved Loss Costs Effective November 1, 2015

As of January 1, 2016, New Jersey does not allow carriers to deviate from the approved New Jersey Bureau rates in the voluntary market. Thus, there is no variation in price from carrier to carrier. Thus, the only variation in approved rates within a given Delaware classification are due to differences in classification definitions.

Exhibit 3 summarizes results from Exhibit 1 and shows the extreme range of prices approved in each state for types of businesses subject to each Delaware classification included in this study. For the states of Delaware and Pennsylvania (having the same classification plan for the types of businesses addressed in this comparison), these ranges are the result of differences in competitive carrier pricing programs. For the remaining states as compared to Delaware, these extremes include the effects of both competitive pricing and classification differences, where applicable. For each grouping of classifications (Manufacturing, Contracting and Other Industries) and for all studied classifications combined, averages of the low and high rates have been computed using Delaware payrolls as weights.

The DCRB would emphasize that, while the weighting system used on Exhibit 3 provides a means of combining the various endpoints observed for approved rates falling within specified Delaware classifications in other jurisdictions, the "average" values shown would NOT represent averages for those other states themselves. This difference is attributable to the matter previously discussed regarding proper exposure weights and the fact that the DCRB does not

generally have other states' exposure data separately for the parts of classifications pertinent to this study.

INTERPRETATION OF STUDY RESULTS

To the extent that prevailing differences in rates are discovered in a study such as this one, questions often arise as to why such differences persist. The DCRB would suggest that state-to-state differences arise between workers compensation insurance rates primarily because each jurisdiction separately establishes benefits and administrative procedures pertinent to this line of business, and each state's workers compensation system must interact with different industrial, economic and social climates. In short, workers compensation insurance costs more where losses and insurer expenses are higher, and less where losses and insurer expenses are lower. It is not generally the case that differences in insurance cost are attributable to differences in insurance carrier requirements for operating margins or profits. Further, each carrier is likely to have consistent objectives in managing and paying claims in various jurisdictions, subject to the specific constraints and requirements of each administrative system. In fact, many of the <u>same</u> insurance carriers actively write workers compensation business in more than one of the states subject to this study.

It is beyond the scope of this study to definitively establish and/or quantify reasons for the observed differences in workers compensation rates between the jurisdictions addressed herein. In its previous rate comparison studies, however, the DCRB offered some general observations in order to illustrate the kinds of differences which may arise between different state workers compensation systems.

- The Delaware maximum indemnity benefit is set at two-thirds of the Statewide Average Weekly Wage (SAWW). Other states' maximum benefit may be set at another level of SAWW or a set dollar amount. In addition, the SAWW can vary widely from state to state so that states with the same benefit percentage may have significantly different benefit amounts.
- Delaware has a medical fee schedule in place. Other states may not have a fee schedule or may have fee schedules in place, although the schedules may be based on reimbursement rates that differ significantly from state to state.
- Delaware does not specify the use of the AMA Guide to the Evaluation of Permanent Impairment in the evaluation of permanent disability. Other states may use this guide.
- Delaware does not allow offsets for unemployment benefits, Social Security old age benefits and employer funded pension benefits. Other states may allow for benefit offsets or may allow them at varying levels.
- Delaware allows an employee to have free choice of physician. Practices in this regard vary greatly by state, with some allowing employee choice of physician for the life of the claim or for a certain amount of time after the injury.

- Delaware provides no scheduled or pre-funded cost-of-living adjustment for indemnity benefits. Some states do provide such adjustments for certain types of injuries.
- In Delaware, permanent partial and temporary total disability benefits are payable for the duration of disability without limitation. Other states may have different maximum payment levels and/or duration of payments for these types of benefits.

The above observations identify provisions of the Delaware Workers Compensation system and offer alternative provisions that directly influence the cost of insurance in other states and any comparison to Delaware costs. The points noted may produce either lower or higher insurance costs and, therefore, lower or higher insurance rates in a jurisdiction than in Delaware. It must be recognized that many system differences (indeed a great majority of such differences which exist) are omitted entirely from these brief illustrative references. Finally, significant system differences are often manifest in controlling judicial decisions and administrative procedures.

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

DE Class Code	DE Description	12/15 Loss Cost	Ran DE Rates as Low	ge of of 12/1/15 High	MD Class Code	1/16 Loss Cost	Range MD Rates as o Low		NJ Class Code	Approved NJ Rates 1/1/16		4/16 Loss Cost	Rar PA Rates as Low	nge of s of 4/1/16 High	VA Class Code	4/16 Loss Cost	Rang VA Rates as o Low		WV Class Code	Approved WV 11/15 Loss Costs		nge of as of 11/1/15 High
Grou	p I: Ten (10) Manufacturir	ng Classif	ications																			
104 Food	Products Mfg.	5.09	4.78	13.14	4717 4825 6503 6504 8102 8203	2.10 0.69 1.00 2.08 1.79 6.60	1.99 0.65 0.95 1.97 1.70 6.26	6.69 2.20 3.19 6.62 5.70 21.02	2150 4627 4628 6504 8102	10.77 4.22 2.39 5.46 4.06	104	2.90	2.61	8.78	2055 4717 4825 6503 6504 8203	1.15 1.47 0.95 1.24 1.68 4.31	1.15 1.47 0.95 1.24 1.68 4.31	2.76 3.53 2.28 2.97 4.03 10.34	4717 4825 6503 6504 8102 8203	1.34 0.46 1.20 2.15 1.23 3.65	1.01 0.35 0.90 1.61 0.92 2.74	3.22 1.10 2.88 5.16 2.95 8.76
112 Bever	rage Mfg.	14.37	13.49	37.09	2157	3.75	3.56	11.94	2157	(A) Rated	112	8.46	7.61	25.62	2157	2.87	2.87	6.89	2157	3.54	2.66	8.50
222 Plasti	c Mfg.	5.29	4.97	13.65	4273 4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	1.71 1.30 2.63 3.30 1.91 1.76	1.62 1.23 2.50 3.13 1.81 1.67	5.45 4.14 8.38 10.51 6.08 5.61	4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	14.10 6.84 7.03 4.43 4.32	222	2.15	1.94	6.51	4273 4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	1.76 1.00 2.07 1.67 2.30 1.59	1.76 1.00 2.07 1.67 2.30 1.59	4.22 2.40 4.97 4.01 5.52 3.81	4273 4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	1.35 0.90 1.44 1.22 1.61 1.19	1.01 0.68 1.08 0.92 1.21 0.89	3.24 2.16 3.46 2.93 3.86 2.86
227 Oilclo	th Mfg.	3.43	3.22	8.85	4493	1.87	1.77	5.96	4491 4493	5.17 15.04	227	3.12	2.81	9.45	4493	1.92	1.92	4.61	4493	1.52	1.14	3.65
413 Iron W	Vorks	9.53	8.95	24.60	3040 3041	5.92 8.55	5.62 8.11	18.86 27.23	3030 3040 3041	16.46 14.90 5.12	413	4.44	4.00	13.44	3040 3041	4.86 3.52	4.86 3.52	11.66 8.44	3040 3041	3.63 3.21	2.72 2.41	8.71 7.70
454 Sheet Fab	Metal Products Shop	8.33	7.82	21.50	3064 3076 3220 3224 3227 3400 3803 3803	5.61 2.34 1.47 3.18 2.25 2.84 2.22 2.06	5.32 2.22 1.40 3.02 2.14 2.70 2.11 1.95	17.87 7.45 4.68 10.13 7.17 9.05 7.07 6.56	3045 3066 3075 3076 3220 3227 3400 3807	14.79 8.93 8.93 7.83 4.64 6.52 6.61 3.51	454	2.46	2.21	7.45	3064 3076 3220 3224 3227 3400 3803 3803	3.63 2.18 1.33 2.11 1.85 2.70 3.42 1.42	3.63 2.18 1.33 2.11 1.85 2.70 3.42 1.42	8.71 5.23 3.19 5.06 4.44 6.48 8.20 3.41	3064 3076 3220 3224 3227 3400 3803 3807	2.27 1.93 0.79 1.62 1.47 1.94 1.48 1.24	1.70 1.45 0.59 1.22 1.10 1.46 1.11 0.93	5.45 4.63 1.90 3.89 3.53 4.66 3.55 2.98
456 Metal	Furniture Mfg.	6.18	5.80	15.95	3076 3169 3179 3632 4902	2.34 2.21 1.47 2.10 2.65	2.22 2.10 1.40 1.99 2.51	7.45 7.04 4.68 6.69 8.44	3076 3169 3632 4902	7.83 6.82 5.12 5.99	456	3.05	2.75	9.24	3076 3169 3179 3632 4902	2.18 2.14 1.34 2.11 1.38	2.18 2.14 1.34 2.11 1.38	5.23 5.13 3.21 5.06 3.31	3076 3169 3179 3632 4902	1.93 1.55 1.12 2.21 1.44	1.45 1.16 0.84 1.66 1.08	4.63 3.72 2.69 5.30 3.46
551 Chem	iical Mfg.	2.00	1.88	5.16	1472 4568 4670 4683 4686 4828 4829	3.68 1.72 7.49 3.34 2.06 1.64 2.53	3.49 1.63 7.11 3.17 1.95 1.56 2.40	11.72 5.48 23.86 10.64 6.56 5.22 8.06	4627 4683 4827 4828 4829	4.22 6.87 11.85 2.64 2.32	551	1.03	0.93	3.12	1472 4568 4670 4683 4686 4828 4829	2.27 1.49 5.79 2.15 1.56 1.78 1.12	2.27 1.49 5.78 2.15 1.56 1.78 1.12	5.45 3.57 13.89 5.16 3.74 4.27 2.69	1472 4568 4670 4683 4686 4828 4829	1.73 1.40 4.10 2.04 1.35 0.90 0.55	1.30 1.05 3.08 1.53 1.01 0.68 0.41	4.15 3.36 9.84 4.90 3.24 2.16 1.32
581 Oil Re	Sfining	2.18	2.05	5.63	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741 4751	1.89 3.30 1.51 4.60 1.82 1.96	1.79 3.13 1.43 4.37 1.73 1.86	6.02 10.51 4.81 14.65 5.80 6.24	4459 4712 4740 4741	7.03 4.06 1.65 4.22	581	1.77	1.59	5.36	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741 4751	1.36 1.67 1.24 1.01 1.41 1.56	1.36 1.67 1.24 1.01 1.41 1.56	3.26 4.01 2.97 2.42 3.38 3.74	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741 4751	1.16 1.22 0.94 0.60 1.03 1.23	0.87 0.92 0.71 0.45 0.77 0.92	2.78 2.93 2.26 1.44 2.47 2.95
757 Teleco	ommunications Company	2.70	2.54	6.97	7600 8901	3.16 0.14	3.00 0.13	10.06 0.45	7600 8901	10.42 0.28	757	1.49	1.34	4.51	7600 8901	1.87 0.09	1.87 0.09	4.49 0.22	7600 8901	2.06 0.12	1.55 0.09	4.94 0.29

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.

Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

DE Class Code	DE Description	12/15 Loss Cost	Ran DE Rates as Low	ge of of 12/1/15 High	MD Class Code	1/16 Loss Cost	Rang MD Rates as Low		NJ Class Code	Approved NJ Rates 1/1/16		4/16 Loss Cost	Ranı PA Rates as Low		VA Class Code	4/16 Loss Cost	Ra VA Rates a Low	inge of as of 4/1/16 High	WV Class Code	Approved WV 11/15 Loss Costs		ange of s as of 11/1/15 High
Grou	up II: Ten (10) Constructior	n Classifie	cations																			
601 Road	d Construction	12.11	11.37	31.26	5506 7720 9019	5.33 2.26 1.57	5.06 2.14 1.49	16.98 7.20 5.00	5500 6042 7720	13.00 8.82 3.24	601	5.79	5.21	17.53	5506 9019	5.46 1.45	5.45 1.45	13.10 3.48	5506 9019	6.11 1.18	4.58 0.89	14.66 2.83
608 Flat	Cement Work	7.30	6.85	18.84	5215 5221 6204	5.32 4.74 9.14	5.05 4.50 8.67	16.94 15.10 29.11	5200 5213 5215	11.63 18.47 13.39	608	5.42	4.88	16.41	5215 5221 6204	3.99 4.04 9.19	3.99 4.04 9.18	9.57 9.69 22.05	5215 5221 6204	3.06 2.14 4.71	2.30 1.61 3.53	7.34 5.14 11.30
609 Exca	avation	6.24	5.86	16.11	5703 6018 6045 6217 6229 6233	14.91 2.51 3.69 4.60 3.46 4.99	14.15 2.38 3.50 4.37 3.28 4.74	47.49 7.99 11.75 14.65 11.02 15.89	1605 5703 6039 6217 6233	9.14 31.10 11.32 9.14 7.30	609	3.76	3.38	11.39	1605 5703 6018 6045 6217 6229 6233	4.70 8.70 4.67 2.28 4.54 4.16 3.73	4.70 8.69 4.67 2.28 4.54 4.16 3.73	11.28 20.87 11.20 5.47 10.89 9.98 8.95	5703 6018 6045 6217 6229 6233	7.09 1.46 2.46 2.43 2.70 2.05	5.32 1.10 1.85 1.82 2.03 1.54	17.02 3.50 5.90 5.83 6.48 4.92
651 Carp	entry - Commerical Structures	7.70	7.23	19.87	5102 5402 5403 5473	5.50 4.36 5.28 16.78	5.22 4.14 5.01 15.92	17.52 13.89 16.82 53.44	5103 5402 5403 5701	12.76 19.90 19.51 23.21	651	6.14	5.53	18.59	5102 5402 5403 5473	3.79 3.58 5.16 6.19	3.79 3.58 5.15 6.18	9.09 8.59 12.38 14.85	5102 5402 5403 5473	3.07 2.54 4.69 3.93	2.30 1.91 3.52 2.95	7.37 6.10 11.26 9.43
652 Carp	pentry - Residential	10.34	9.71	26.69	5102 5645	5.50 7.41	5.22 7.03	17.52 23.60	5645	19.51	652	7.89	7.10	23.89	5102 5645 5651	3.79 9.74 8.03	3.79 9.73 8.02	9.09 23.37 19.26	5102 5645	3.07 8.03	2.30 6.02	7.37 19.27
653 Maso	onry	9.37	8.80	24.18	5022	7.10	6.74	22.61	5022 5213 5458 5459 5701	17.57 18.47 27.01 27.01 23.21	653	6.64	5.98	20.11	5022	6.22	6.21	14.92	5022	5.08	3.81	12.19
	trical Wiring - in Buildings	3.70	3.47	9.55	5190	2.92	2.77	9.30	5190	6.23	661	3.00	2.70	9.08	5190	2.28	2.28	5.47	5190	1.43	1.07	3.43
663 Plum	nbing	5.05	4.74	13.03	5183 5188 5472	4.37 4.52 6.12	4.15 4.29 5.81	13.92 14.40 19.49	5183 5184 5188	7.30 4.18 6.38	663	3.55	3.20	10.75	5183 5188 5472	3.04 3.18 4.26	3.04 3.18 4.26	7.29 7.63 10.22	5183 5188 5472	1.32 1.55 2.83	0.99 1.16 2.12	3.17 3.72 6.79
	ting ,Ventilating or Air ditioning Contractor	6.22	5.84	16.05	5537	3.98	3.78	12.68	3724 5183 5190 5538	8.19 7.30 6.23 9.55	664	3.28	2.95	9.93	5537	3.71	3.71	8.90	5537	2.63	1.97	6.31
	hinery or Equipment tion or Repair	5.23	4.91	13.50	3724 5160 9534	4.00 2.33 7.41	3.80 2.21 7.03	12.74 7.42 23.60	3724 5160	8.19 6.27	675	3.20	2.88	9.69	3724 5160 9534	3.20 2.62 3.08	3.20 2.62 3.08	7.68 6.29 7.39	3724 5160 9534	3.21 1.37 2.94	2.41 1.03 2.21	7.70 3.29 7.06

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

DE Class Code	DE Description	12/15 Loss Cost	Ranç DE Rates as Low			1/16 Loss Cost	Rang MD Rates as Low		NJ Class Code	Approved NJ Rates 1/1/16	PA Class Code		Ran PA Rates as Low	ge of of 4/1/16 High	VA Class Code	4/16 Loss Cost	Ran VA Rates as Low	nge of s of 4/1/16 High	WV Class Code	Approved WV 11/15 Loss Costs		inge of as of 11/1/15 High
Grou	up III: Ten (10) "Other" Cl	assificatio	ns																			
818 Auto	mobile Dealer	2.05	1.92	5.29	8002 8380 8385	1.28 2.59 1.96	1.21 2.46 1.86	4.08 8.25 6.24	7369 8398 8748	6.02 6.02 1.38	818	1.13	1.02	3.42	8002 8380 8385	1.70 2.42 1.72	1.70 2.42 1.72	4.08 5.81 4.13	8002 8380 8385	1.12 1.73 1.56	0.84 1.30 1.17	2.69 4.15 3.74
	try, Fish Dealer essor	3.49	3.28	9.01	0034 2095 2114 8021	2.51 3.18 2.15 2.98	2.38 3.02 2.04 2.83	7.99 10.13 6.85 9.49	2089 2095 2114 8021	8.61 8.61 7.19 9.09	865	3.56	3.20	10.78	0034 2095 2114 8021	1.97 2.70 1.54 2.73	1.97 2.70 1.54 2.73	4.73 6.48 3.69 6.55	0034 2095 2114 8021	2.59 2.75 1.30 1.65	1.94 2.06 0.98 1.24	6.22 6.60 3.12 3.96
917 Groc	ery Store	4.21	3.95	10.87	8006 8033	1.71 2.91	1.62 2.76	5.45 9.27	8006 8033 8753	3.26 6.27 3.26	917	1.67	1.50	5.06	8006 8033	1.73 1.66	1.73 1.66	4.15 3.98	8006 8033	0.92 1.08	0.69 0.81	2.21 2.59
928 Reta	il Store	3.09	2.90	7.98	4360 4361 8017 8072 8831	0.72 0.64 1.24 0.62 1.15	0.68 0.61 1.18 0.59 1.09	2.29 2.04 3.95 1.97 3.66	4360 4361 8017	1.56 1.56 4.06	928	1.76	1.58	5.33	4360 4361 8017 8072 8831	0.96 0.84 1.25 0.62 1.27	0.96 0.84 1.25 1.25 0.62	2.30 2.02 3.00 3.00 1.49	4360 4361 8017 8072 8831	0.56 0.55 0.63 0.50 0.77	0.42 0.41 0.47 0.38 0.58	1.34 1.32 1.51 1.20 1.85
951 Sale:	sperson - Outside	0.56	0.53	1.45	8720 8721 8742 9012	0.85 0.23 0.26 0.83	0.81 0.22 0.25 0.79	2.71 0.73 0.83 2.64	8720 8742	2.18 0.51	951	0.31	0.28	0.94	8720 8721 8742 9012	1.16 0.20 0.19 0.77	1.16 0.20 0.19 0.77	2.78 0.48 0.46 1.85	8720 8721 8742 9012	0.74 0.18 0.25 0.56	0.56 0.14 0.19 0.42	1.78 0.43 0.60 1.34
953 Offic	e	0.24	0.23	0.62	8603 8803 8810 8871	0.06 0.05 0.10 0.07	0.06 0.05 0.09 0.07	0.19 0.16 0.32 0.22	8803 8810	0.28 0.28	953	0.12	0.11	0.36	8603 8803 8810 8871	0.08 0.04 0.09 0.08	0.08 0.04 0.09 0.08	0.19 0.10 0.22 0.19	8603 8803 8810 8871	0.10 0.05 0.14 0.08	0.08 0.04 0.11 0.06	0.24 0.12 0.34 0.19
957 Phys	sicians or Dentists	0.73	0.69	1.88	8832	0.24	0.21	0.61	8832	0.64	957	0.34	0.31	1.03	8832	0.24	0.23	0.54	8832	0.16	0.18	0.49
960 Nurs	ing Convalescent Home	4.11	3.86	10.61	8829	1.79	1.70	5.70	8829	5.76	960	2.32	2.09	7.02	8829	1.69	1.69	4.05	8829	1.98	1.49	4.75
971 Com	mercial Building	4.18	3.93	10.79	9014 9015 9170	2.24 2.66 5.14	2.13 2.52 4.88	7.13 8.47 16.37	9014 9015	6.73 8.70	971	2.98	2.68	9.02	9014 9015 9023 9170	2.04 1.94 2.14 3.70	2.04 1.94 2.14 3.70	4.89 4.65 5.13 8.88	9014 9015 9170	1.63 1.86 3.19	1.22 1.40 2.39	3.91 4.46 7.66
975 Rest	aurants	1.93	1.81	4.98	9082	1.05	1.00	3.34	9078 9079	7.00 3.90	975	1.31	1.18	3.97	9082	1.06	1.06	2.54	9082	0.63	0.47	1.51

DELAWARE COMPENSATION RATING BUREAU., INC.

Classification Descriptions for States Other than Delaware Used in Rate Comparison

The following listing presents brief descriptions of classification definitions from states other than Delaware used in the DCRB's rate comparison study. For detailed definitions, refer to each state's classification manual and related rules.

SECTION 1: MANUFACTURING CLASSIFICATION CODES

MARYLAND

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	Code	Business
104	4717	Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4825	Flavorings, Licorice or Medicinal Extract Mfg. Rated as Drug, Medicine or
		Pharmaceutical Mfg.
	6503	Potato Chip, Popcorn & Snack Chip Mfg.
	6504	Food Sundries Mfg., N.O.C.
	8102	Peanut Handling Rated as Seed Merchant
	8203	Ice Mfg. Or Distribution & Drivers
112	2157	Bottling - All Operations & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4273	Bag Mfg Paper or Plastic
	4431	Magnetic or Optical Recording Media Mfg.
	4452	Plastic Extruded Products Mfg., Rated as Plastics Mfg of Sheets, Rods,
		Tubes, etc.
	4459	Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Plastics Mfg., Molded Products, N.O.C.
227	4493	Oilcloth or Linoleum Mfg Rated as Fabric Coating or Impregnating,
		N.O.C.
413	3040	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3041	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Decorative or Artistic -
		Foundries, Drivers
454	3064	Sign Mfg Metal Or Neon - Shop Only
	3076	Sheet Metal Products Mfg - Shop
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Enamel Ware Mfg.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Stamped Goods, Mfg., N.O.C.
	3803	Automobile Wheel Mfg Metal - Not Cast
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg
456	3076	Sheet Metal Products Mfg - Shop
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3179	Electrical Apparatus Mfg.
	3632	Laundry Equipment Mfg - Commercial
/	4902	Exercise Equipment Mfg.
551	1472	DistillationWoodand Drivers. Coke Mfg. and Drivers
	4568	Salt, Borax or Potash Producing or Refining and Drivers
	4670	Cottonseed Oil MfgMechanical and Drivers
	4683	Oil MfgVegetableNOC. Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4686	Oil MfgVegetableSolvent Extraction Process Chemical Blending or Mixing NOCAll Operations and Drivers. Chemical
	4828	Mixing, Blending and Repackaging OnlyNot Manufacturing of Ingredients Chemical Mfg. NOCAll Operations and DriversIncludes Blending or
	4829	Mixing. Chemical MfgIncluding Mixing, Blending and Packaging

SECTION 1 MARYLAND (continued)

581	2305	Textile Mfg Synthetic
	4459	Plastic Materials Mfg Rated as Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4557	Lubricants Mfg Grease/Oil Mixing Rated as Ink Mfg.
	4740	Oil Refining, Petroleum
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining
	4751	Synthetic Rubber Mfg.
757	7600	Telecommunications CoCable TV or SatelliteAll Other Employees and
		Drivers
	8901	Television Community Coaxial Cable Company Contractor: Studio or
		Exchange Employees and Clerical. Telecommunications CoOffice or
		Exchange Employees and Clerical

NEW JERSEY

Delaware	New Jersey	New Jersey
Classification	Classification	Description of
Code	Code	Business
104	2150	Ice Mfg.
104	4627	Extract Mfg Dyewood Licorice or Tanning
	4628	Extract Mig Defumery, medicinal or flavoring
	6504	Food Sundries Mfg., N.O.C.
	8102	Pool Sundies Mig., N.O.C. Peanut Handling Rated as Seed Merchant
112	2157	Bottling NOC & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4431	Magnetic or Optical Recording Media Mfg.
222	4452	Plastics Mfg: Fabricated Products N.O.C.
	4459	Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Plastics Mfg., Molded Products , N.O.C.
227	4491	Linoleum Mfg Burlap or Felt
	4493	Fabric Coating or Impregnating , N.O.C.
413		+ Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural & Drivers
110	3040	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3041	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Decorative or Artistic -
	0011	Foundries, Drivers
454	3045	Steel Barrel Or Drum Mfg.
	3066	Sheet Metal Work - Shop
	3075	Coppersmith - Shop
	3076	Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Goods Mfg., N.O.C., also Metal Stamping - Shop
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg.
456	3076	Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3632	Laundry Equipment Mfg - Commercial
	4902	Exercise Equipment Mfg.
551	4627	Extract Mfg - Dyewood, Licorice Or Tanning
	4683	Oil Mfg - Vegetable - Noc
	4827	Dye Or Dye Intermediate Mfg Noc
	4828	Chemical Blending or Mixing NOC - All Operations & Drivers
	4829	Chemical Mfg. NOCAll Operations and DriversIncludes Blending or
		Mixing. Chemical MfgIncluding Mixing, Blending and Packaging
581	4459	Electric Light Or Power Cooperative Rea Project Only- & D.
	4712	Telephone Or Telegraph Co & D
	4740	Telephone Or Telegraph Co - Office Or Exchange Employees & C
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining & Drivers
757	7600	Telephone Or Telegraph Co & D
	8901	Telephone Or Telegraph Co - Office Or Exchange Employees & C

SECTION 1 PENNSYLVANIA

As of January 1, 2015, each of the Delaware manufacturing classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

VIRGINIA

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
Code	Code	Business
104	2055	Peanut Handling
	4717	Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4825	Extract Mfg. (Flavoring, Licorice, Perfumery or Medicinal) Rated as Drug,
		Medicine or Pharmaceutical Mfg.
	6503	Potato Chip, Popcorn & Snack Chip Mfg.
	6504	Food Sundries Mfg.
	8203	Ice Mfg. Or Distribution & Drivers
112	2157	Bottling - All Operations & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4273	Bag Mfg Paper or Plastic
	4431	Phonograph Mfg.
	4452	Plastic Extruded Products Mfg., Rated as Plastics - Mfg. of Sheets, Rods,
		Tubes, etc.
	4459	Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Plastics Mfg., Molded Products, N.O.C.
227	4493	Oilcloth or Linoleum Mfg Rated as Fabric Coating or Impregnating
413	3040	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3041	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Decorative or Artistic -
		Foundries, Drivers
454	3064	Sign Mfg Metal Or Neon - Shop Only
	3076	Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Enamel Ware Mfg.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Stamped Goods, Mfg., N.O.C.
	3803	Automobile Wheel Mfg Metal - Not Cast
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg
551	1472	DistillationWoodand Drivers. Coke Mfg. and Drivers
	4568	Salt, Borax or Potash Producing or Refining and Drivers
	4670	Cottonseed Oil MfgMechanical and Drivers
	4683	Oil MfgVegetableNOC. Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4686	Oil MfgVegetableSolvent Extraction Process
		Chemical Blending or Mixing NOCAll Operations and Drivers. Chemical
	4828	Mixing, Blending and Repackaging OnlyNot Manufacturing of Ingredients
		Chemical Mfg. NOCAll Operations and DriversIncludes Blending or
	4829	Mixing. Chemical MfgIncluding Mixing, Blending and Packaging
456	3076	Sheet Metal Products Mfg - Shop
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3179	Electrical Apparatus Mfg.
	3632	Laundry Equipment Mfg - Commercial
	4902	Exercise Equipment Mfg.
551	1472	DistillationWoodand Drivers. Coke Mfg. and Drivers
	4568	Salt, Borax or Potash Producing or Refining and Drivers
	4670	Cottonseed Oil MfgMechanical and Drivers
	4683	Oil MfgVegetableNOC. Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4686	Oil MfgVegetableSolvent Extraction Process
		Chemical Blending or Mixing NOCAll Operations and Drivers. Chemical
	4828	Mixing, Blending and Repackaging OnlyNot Manufacturing of Ingredients
	4829	

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	Virginia Classification <u>Code</u>	Virginia Description of <u>Business</u>
581	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741 4751	Textile Fiber Mfg Synthetic Plastic Materials Mfg., Rated as Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes Lubricants Mfg Grease/Oil Mixing - Rated as Ink Mfg. Oil Refining - Petroleum Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining Synthetic Rubber Mfg. Telecommunications CoCable TV or SatelliteAll Other Employees and Drivers. Telecommunications CoCable TV or SatelliteAll Other Employees and Drviers. Telecommunications CoTelephone, Cable TV, or SatelliteAll Other Employees and Drivers. Telephone or Cable TV Line InstallationContractors, Service Lines and Connections and Drivers. Telephone or Telegraph Co.: All Other Employees and Drivers. Television Community Coaxial Cable Company Contractor: Service Connections and
757	7600 8901	Drivers Television Community Coaxial Cable Company Contractor: Studio or Exchange Employees and Clerical. Telecommunications CoOffice or Exchange Employees and Clerical

WEST VIRGINIA

Delaware	West Virginia	West Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	Code	Business
104	4717	Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4825	Drug, Medicine or Pharmaceutical Preparation Mfg Includes Mfg. of
		Ingredients
	6503	
	6504	Food and Sundries Mfg. , N.O.C.
	8102	Seed Merchant
	8103	
112	2157	Bottling - All Operations & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4273	
	4431	Magnetic or Optical Recording Media Mfg.
	4452	Plastics Mfg - Fabricated Products N.O.C.
	4459	Plastics Mfg. Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Molding and Fabricated Plastic Products Mfg., N.O.C.
227	4493	Fabric Coating or Impregnating N.O.C.
413	3040	Iron or Steel: Fabrication: Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3041	
454	3064	Sign Manufacturing Metal
	3076	Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Coating of Metal Ware , N.O.C.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Goods Mfg., N.O.C.
	3803	Automobile Wheel Mfg Metal - Not Cast
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg.
456	3076	Sheet Metal Products Mfg - Shop
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3179	Electrical Apparatus Mfg.
	3632	Laundry Equipment Mfg - Commercial
	4902	Exercise Equipment Mfg.

SECTION 1 WEST VIRGINIA (continued)

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	West Virginia Classification <u>Code</u>	West Virginia Description of <u>Business</u>
551	1472	DistillationWoodand Drivers. Coke Mfg. and Drivers
	4568	Salt, Borax or Potash Producing or Refining and Drivers
	4670	Cottonseed Oil MfgMechanical and Drivers
	4683	Oil MfgVegetableNOC. Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4686	Oil MfgVegetableSolvent Extraction Process
	4828	Chemical Blending Or Mixing, NOC - All Operations and Drivers
	4829	
581	2305	Synthetic Fiber Mfg Rated as Manufacturing - Textiles
	4459	Plastics Mfg Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4557	Ink Mfg.
	4740	Oil Refining
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining & Drivers
	4751	Synthetic Rubber Mfg.
757	7600	Telephone or Telegraph Co.: All Other Employees & Drivers
	8901	Telephone or Telegraph Co Office or Exchange Employees & Clerical

SECTION 2: CONTRACTING CLASSIFICATION CODES

MARYLAND

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Description of <u>Business</u>
601	5506	Street or Road Construction, Paving or Repaving
	7720	Police Officers & Drivers
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors, Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks
	6204	Drilling, N.O.C.
609	5703	Building Moving or Raising
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations
	6045	Levee Construction - All Operations to Completion
	6217	Excavation
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System Construction
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction

SECTION 2 MARYLAND (continued)

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Description of <u>Business</u>
651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C.
	5473	Asbestos Contractor - NOC & Drivers
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Construction of Residential Dwellings Not Exceeding Three
		Stories in Height
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings

SECTION 2 MARYLAND (continued)

Delaware Classification	Maryland Classification	Maryland Description of
<u>Code</u>	Code	Business
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation
	5472	Asbestos Contractor - Pipe and Boiler Work Exclusively & Drivers
664	5537	Heating, Ventilation, Air-Conditioning And Refrigerations Systems -
		Insallation, Service and Repair, Shop, Yard & Drivers
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	9534	Mobile Crane & Hoisting Service

SECTION 2 NEW JERSEY

Delaware	New Jersey	New Jersey
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	Code	Business
601	5500	Street or Road Paving, Surfacing or Resurfacing & Drivers
	6042	Street or Road Construction & Drivers
	7720	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5200	Cement Work - Sidewalks, Cellar Floors, Driveways including Drivers
	5213	Concrete Construction, N.O.C.
	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
609	1605	Excavation - Rock & Drivers
	5703	Building Underpinning - Rated as Building Moving or Raising
	6039	Grading of Land , N.O.C. & Drivers
	6217	Excavation NOC & Drivers
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction & Drivers
651	5103	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection or Repair - Metal or Metal Covered &
		Drivers
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C. & Drivers
	5701	Wrecking: Buildings or Structures
652	5645	Carpentry - Construction of Residential Dwellings Not Exceeding Three
		Stories in Height
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
	5213	Concrete Construction, N.O.C.
	5458	Cleaning or Renovating Building Exteriors - No Sandblasting or Use of
		Siliceous Materials & Drivers
	5459	Cleaning or Renovating Building Exteriors - , N.O.C. & Drivers
	5701	Wrecking: Buildings or Structures - Not Marine
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings & Drivers
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C. & Drivers
	5184	Steam Pipe or Boiler Insulating & Shop, Drivers
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation & Drivers
664	3724	Millwright Work, N.O.C. & Drivers Machinery or Equipment Erection or
	0.2.	Repair NOC & Drivers
	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5190	Electrical Wiring - Within Buildings
	5538	Sheet Metal Work - Shop and Outside & Drivers NOC
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
010	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	5100	LIEVALUI LIEULUII UI IVEPAII

SECTION 2 PENNSYLVANIA

As of January 1, 2015, each of the Delaware contracting classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

VIRGINIA

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	Code	Business
601	5506	Street or Road Construction, Paving or Repaving
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors, Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks
	6204	Drilling, N.O.C.
609	1605	Excavation - Rock
	5703	Building Moving or Raising
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations
	6045	Levee Construction - All Operations to Completion
	6217	Excavation
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System Construction
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction
651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C.
	5473	Asbestos Contractor - NOC & Drivers
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Construction of Residential Dwellings Not Exceeding Three
		Stories in Height
	5651	Carpentry - Dwellings - Three Stories or Less
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation
	5472	Asbestos Contractor - Pipe and Boiler Work Exclusively & Drivers
664	5537	Heating, Ventilation, Air-Conditioning and Refrigeration Systems -
		Installation, Service and Repair & Drivers
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	9534	Mobile Crane & Hoisting Service
		5

WEST VIRGINIA

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	West Virginia Classification <u>Code</u>	West Virginia Description of <u>Business</u>
601	5506	Street and Road Construction
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5215	Cellar, Concrete Floor, Sidewalk, Driveway and Foundation Construction
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors, Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks &
		Drivers
	6204	Drilling N.O.C. & Drivers
609	5703	Building Moving Rated as Building Razing, Moving or Demolition
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations &
		Drivers
	6045	Levee Construction - All Operations to Completion
	6217	Excavation, N.O.C.
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System Construction & Drivers
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction

SECTION 2 WEST VIRGINIA (continued)

651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C.
	5473	Asbestos Contractor - NOC & Drivers
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Construction of Residential Dwellings Not Exceeding Three
		Stories in Height
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings
663	5183	Plumbing and Pipefitting , N.O.C.
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation & Drivers
	5472	Asbestos Contractor - Pipe and Boiler Work Exclusively & Drivers
664	5537	Heating, Ventilation, Air-Conditioning and Refrigeration Systems -
		Installation, Service and Repair & Drivers
675	3724	Millwright Work
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	9534	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service Contractors - N.O.C All Operations &
		Drivers

SECTION 3: OTHER INDUSTRIES CLASSIFICATION CODES

MARYLAND

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	Business
818	8002	Auto Rental Co - All Other Employees
	8380	Auto Sales or Service Agency
	8385	Auto Rental Garage Employees
865	0034	Poultry Or Egg Producer & Drivers
	2095	Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C.
	2114	Oyster Processing
	8021	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale
917	8006	Store: GroceryRetail. StoreGrocery RetailIncludes Rural General
		Stores. StoresGroceries and ProvisionsRetail
	8033	Store: Meat, Grocery and Provision (Combined)RetailNOC
928	4360	Motion Picture - Development of Negatives, Printing and All Subsequent
		Operations
	4361	Photographer
	8017	Store: Retail, N.O.C.
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disk, Software, Video or Audio Cassette -
		Retail
	8831	Pet Grooming - Rated as Hospital - Veterinary
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes NOC. Race Track
		HorseJudges, Timekeepers, Handicappers or Their Assistants
	8721	Appraising of Buildings. Real Estate Appraisal CompanyOutside
		Employees
	8742	Salespersons or Collectors
	8803	Auditor, Accountant, or Computer System Designer or Programmer
		Traveling
	9012	Apartments, Tenements and DwellingsCare and Custody. Building or
		Property ManagementProperty Managers and Leasing Agents & Clerical,
		Salespersons. Apartment Property Managers and Leasing Agents
953	8603	Architectural or Engineering Firm - Clerical
	8810	Clerical Office Employees, N.O.C.
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees
957	8832	Physician & Clerical
960 **	8829	Convalescent or Nursing Home - All Employees

SECTION 3 MARYLAND (continued)

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Classification <u>Code</u>	Maryland Description of <u>Business</u>
971	9014 9015	Buildings - Operation by Contractor Buildings - Operation by Owner Janitorial Services by Contractors - Includes Window Cleaning Above
975 **	9170 9082	Ground Level & Drivers Restaurant, N.O.C.
NEW JERSEY		
Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	New Jersey Classification <u>Code</u>	New Jersey Description of <u>Business</u>
818	7369 8398	Auto or Truck Rental or Leasing or Livery Co. Automobile Sales or Service Agency & Parts, Service Dept. Employees & Drivers
865	8748 0034 2089 2095 2114	Automobile Salespersons Poultry Or Egg Producer & Drivers Packing House - Meat Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C. Oystermen
917	8021 8006 8033	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale Store - Retail & Drivers Store- Meat Grocery And Provision (Combined) - Retail - Noc
928	8753 4360 4361 8017	Coffee, Tea Or Grocery Dealer - Retail - & Drivers Photographer - All Employees & Clerical, Salesman, Drivers Photographer Store: Retail, N.O.C.
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes NOC. Race Track HorseJudges, Timekeepers, Handicappers or Their Assistants
953	8742 8803 8810	Salespersons or Collectors Auditor, Accountant, or Computer System Designer or Programmer Traveling Auditor, Accountant, or Computer System Designer or Programmer
957 960 **	8832 8829 *	Traveling Physician & Clerical
960 ***	9014 9015	Convalescent or Nursing Home including Drivers Buildings - Operation by Contractors & Drivers Building NOC - Operation by Owner or Lessee
975 **	9078	Commisary Work

Restaurant

PENNSYLVANIA

As of January 1, 2015, each of the Delaware other industries classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

9079

865

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
		Business
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	DUSILIESS
818	8002	Auto Rental Co - All Other Employees
	8380	Auto Sales or Service Agency
	8385	Auto Rental Garage Employees
865	0034	Poultry Or Egg Producer & Drivers
	2095	Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C.
	2114	Oyster Processing
	8021	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale
917	8006	Store: GroceryRetail. StoreGrocery RetailIncludes Rural General
		Stores. StoresGroceries and ProvisionsRetail
	8033	Store: Meat, Grocery and Provision (Combined)RetailNOC
928	4360	Motion Picture Development of Negatives, Printing and All Subsequent Operations
	4361	Photographer
	8017	Store: Retail, N.O.C.
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disc, Software, Video or Audio Cassette
		Store-Retail
	8831	Pet Grooming - Rated as Hospital - Veterinary
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes NOC. Race Track
		HorseJudges, Timekeepers, Handicappers or Their Assistants
	8721	Appraising of Buildings. Real Estate Appraisal CompanyOutside
		Employees
	8742	Salespersons or Collectors
	8803	Auditor, Accountant, or Computer System Designer or Programmer
		Traveling
	9012	Apartments, Tenements and DwellingsCare and Custody. Building or
		Property ManagementProperty Managers and Leasing Agents & Clerical,
		Salespersons. Apartment Property Managers and Leasing Agents
953	8603	Architectural or Engineering Firm - Clerical
	8810	Office, N.O.C.
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees
957	8832	Physician & Clerical
960 **	8829	Convalescent or Nursing Home - All Employees
971	9014	Buildings - Operation by Contractor
	9015	Buildings - Operation by Owner
	9023	Buildings - Residential - Operation by Owner or Lessee
	9170	Janitorial Services by Contractors - Includes Window Cleaning Above
		Ground Level & Drivers
975	9082	Restaurant N.O.C.
SECTION 3		
WEST VIRGINIA		
Delaware	Most Virginia	Most Virginia
Classification	West Virginia Classification	West Virginia
	Classification	Description of Business
<u>Code</u>	0008	DUSITIESS
		Automobile Rental Co.: All Other Employees & Counter Personnel &
818	8002	Drivers
	8380	Automobile Service or Repair Center & Drivers
	8385	Automobile/Truck Equipment Rental
		Operations

Operations

Oyster Processing

0034 2095 2114

8021

Poultry Or Egg Producer & Drivers Meat Products Mfg N.O.C.

Store: Meat, Fish or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale

SECTION 3 WEST VIRGINIA (Continued)

Delaware	West Virginia	West Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	Business
047	0000	Stars, Cassen, Detail Stars, Cassen, Detail Jashudas Dural Cassen
917	8006	Store: GroceryRetail. StoreGrocery RetailIncludes Rural General
	0000	Stores. StoresGroceries and ProvisionsRetail
000	8033	Store: Meat, Grocery and Provision (Combined)RetailNOC
928	4360	Motion Picture Development of Negatives, Printing and All Subsequent
	1001	Operations
	4361	Photographers
	8017	Retail Stores, N.O.C.
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disk, Software, Video or Audio Cassette
		Retail
	8831	Dog Salons - Rated as Veterinarian Hospital
951	8720	Inspection or Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes NOC
	8721	Real Estate Appraisal Company - Outside Employees
	8742	Salespersons or Collectors
	8803	Auditors, Accountaint or Factory Cost or Office Systematizer - Traveling
	9012	Buildings - Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm
953	8603	Architectural or Engineering Firm - Clerical
	8810	Clerical Employees, N.O.C.
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees
957	8832	Physician & Clerical
960**	8829	Nursing Homes
971	9014	Building Maintenance
	9015	Buildings - Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm
	9170	Buildings - Operation by Contractors - Includes window cleaning above one
		story
975 **	9082	Restaurant N.O.C.

NOTES:

"N.O.C." Not otherwise classified in state manual

Designates classification which includes all employees including office Designates classification which includes all employees EXCEPT office Included per recommendation of states rating agency. *

- **
- +

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. Summary Rate Comparison for Selected Largest Delaware Classifications

	DE	DE R Effective			Rates ve 1/1/16		Rates /e 1/1/16		Rates ve 4/1/16		Rates ve 4/1/16		Rates e 11/1/15
3-Yr	Code Description	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High
DE													
Payroll	Group I: Manufacturing Classifications												
110,205	104 Food Products Mfg.	\$4.78	\$13.14	\$0.65	\$21.02	\$2.39	\$10.77	\$2.61	\$8.78	\$0.95	\$10.34	\$0.35	\$8.76
27,432	112 Beverage Mfg.	13.49	37.09	3.56	11.94	(A) Rated	(A) Rated	7.61	25.62	2.87	6.89	2.66	8.50
101,011	222 Plastic Mfg.	4.97	13.65	1.23	10.51	4.32	14.10	1.94	6.51	1.00	5.52	0.68	3.86
104,189	227 Oilcloth Mfg.	3.22	8.85	1.77	5.96	5.17	15.04	2.81	9.45	1.92	4.61	1.14	3.65
30,772	413 Iron Works	8.95	24.60	5.62	27.23	5.12	16.46	4.00	13.44	3.52	11.66	2.41	8.71
49,412	454 Sheet Metal Products	7.82	21.50	1.40	17.87	3.51	14.79	2.21	7.45	1.33	8.71	0.59	5.45
49,408	456 Metal Furniture Mfg.	5.80	15.95	1.40	8.44	5.12	7.83	2.75	9.24	1.34	5.23	0.84	5.30
152,120	551 Chemical Mfg.	1.88	5.16	1.56	23.86	2.32	11.85	0.93	3.12	1.12	13.89	0.41	9.84
188,774	581 Oil Refining	2.05	5.63	1.43	14.65	1.65	7.03	1.59	5.36	1.01	4.01	0.45	2.95
120,513	757 Telecommunications Company	2.54	6.97	0.13	10.06	0.28	10.42	1.34	4.51	0.09	4.49	0.09	4.94
933,836	Group Average *	\$3.61	\$9.93	\$1.33	\$14.62	\$2.80	\$11.30	\$1.95	\$6.56	\$1.10	\$7.03	\$0.60	\$5.52
333,030	Cloup I Average	ψ5.01	ψ3.33	ψ1.55	φ1 4 .02	ψ2.00	φ11.50	ψ1.55	ψ0.50	φ1.10	ψ1.05	\$0.00	ψ 0. 52
	Group II: Contracting Classifications												
52,610	601 Road Construction	11.37	31.26	1.49	16.98	3.24	13.00	5.21	17.53	1.45	13.10	0.89	14.66
119,961	608 Flat Cement Work	6.85	18.84	4.50	29.11	11.63	18.47	4.88	16.41	3.99	22.05	1.61	11.30
123,995	609 Excavation	5.86	16.11	2.38	47.49	7.30	31.10	3.38	11.39	2.28	20.87	1.10	17.02
88,975	651 Carpentry - Commerical	7.23	19.87	4.14	53.44	12.76	23.21	5.53	18.59	3.58	14.85	1.91	11.26
93,850	652 Carpentry - Residential	9.71	26.69	5.22	23.60	19.51	19.51	7.10	23.89	3.79	23.37	2.30	19.27
61,438	653 Masonry	8.80	24.18	6.74	22.61	17.57	27.01	5.98	20.11	6.21	14.92	3.81	12.19
275,712	661 Electrical Wiring -	3.47	9.55	2.77	9.30	6.23	6.23	2.70	9.08	2.28	5.47	1.07	3.43
287,933	663 Plumbing	4.74	13.03	4.15	19.49	4.18	7.30	3.20	10.75	3.04	10.22	0.99	6.79
210,329	664 Heating, Ventilating or Air	5.84	16.05	3.78	12.68	6.23	9.55	2.95	9.93	3.71	8.90	1.97	6.31
149,177	675 Machinery or Equipment	4.91	13.50	2.21	23.60	6.27	8.19	2.88	9.69	2.62	7.68	1.03	7.70
	Erection or Repair												
1,463,980	Group II Average *	\$5.82	\$16.01	\$3.60	\$22.54	\$7.98	\$13.23	\$3.77	\$12.68	\$3.12	\$12.17	\$1.46	\$9.00
•	Group III: "Other" Classifications												
665,729	818 Automobile Dealer	1.92	5.29	1.21	8.25	1.38	6.02	1.02	3.42	1.70	5.81	0.84	4.15
552,201	865 Poultry, Fish Dealer	3.28	9.01	2.04	10.13	7.19	9.09	3.20	10.78	1.54	6.55	0.98	6.60
298,549	917 Grocery Store	3.95	10.87	1.62	9.27	3.26	6.27	1.50	5.06	1.66	4.15	0.69	2.59
732,086	928 Retail Store	2.90	7.98	0.59	3.95	1.56	4.06	1.58	5.33	0.62	3.00	0.38	1.85
2,333,639	951 Salesperson - Outside	0.53	1.45	0.22	2.71	0.51	2.18	0.28	0.94	0.19	2.78	0.14	1.78
12,890,639	953 Office	0.23	0.62	0.05	0.32	0.28	0.28	0.11	0.36	0.04	0.22	0.04	0.34
2,214,777	957 Physicians or Dentists	0.69	1.88	0.21	0.61	0.64	0.64	0.31	1.03	0.23	0.54	0.18	0.49
507,497	960 Nursing Convalescent Home	3.86	10.61	1.70	5.70	5.76	5.76	2.09	7.02	1.69	4.05	1.49	4.75
368,592	971 Commercial Building	3.93	10.79	2.13	16.37	6.73	8.70	2.68	9.02	1.94	8.88	1.22	7.66
675,375	975 Restaurants	1.81	4.98	1.00	3.34	3.90	7.00	1.18	3.97	1.06	2.54	0.47	1.51
21,239,084	Group III Average *	\$0.79	\$2.16	\$0.32	\$1.87	\$1.00	\$1.64	\$0.45	\$1.52	\$0.31	\$1.34	\$0.20	\$1.15
23,636,900	Combined Average - All Groups *	\$1.21	\$3.32	\$0.56	\$3.65	\$1.49	\$2.71	\$0.72	\$2.41	\$0.52	\$2.24	\$0.30	\$1.81

* - Averages Computed Using Delaware Payrolls by Classification as Weights

Exhibit 3